REMARKS

This response is filed under 37 C.F.R. §1.116 after final rejection of all claims, after filing a Notice of Appeal, but before filing an Appeal Brief.

Claims 47 - 147 are pending in the application. Claims 63 - 65, 80 - 140, 142, 144, 145, and 147 are withdrawn from consideration due to an earlier restriction requirement. The pending claims remaining for consideration and subject to examination on the merits are claims 47 - 62, 66 - 79, 141, 143, and 146.

Claim 141 has been amended to present the rejected claim 141 in better form for appeal.

Claim Interpretation

The Examiner has continued to allege that, in accordance with MPEP 2115, claims 66-79 do not further limit claim 47 because these claims relate to materials or articles worked upon by the claimed apparatus. Applicants note that claims 66-79 were amended in Applicants response of December 2005 to clarify the relationship between the materials and the claimed apparatus. As amended, claims 66-79 are directed to embodiments in which the claimed apparatus further comprises particular samples. As such, Applicants contend that claims 66-79 are distinguishable from the cases and fact patterns enumerated in MPEP 2115. Specifically, claims 66-79 are directed to apparatuses that explicitly include a particular sample as an element of the apparatus, thus further defining the claimed apparatus. Accordingly, claims 66-79 do not provide a mere intended use of the claimed apparatus, but rather set forth an additional element of the claimed apparatus.

35 U.S.C. §103(a)

Claims 62, 141, and 146 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as allegedly unpatentable over Murry (US Patent No. 3,614,069; the "069" patent) in view of Berger et al. (US Patent No. 5,484,573; the "573 patent"). Applicants respectfully traverse this rejection.

The criteria for establishing a *prima facie* case of obviousness are detailed in MPEP 2142-2143. Pursuant to MPEP 2142, "To establish a *prima facie* case of obviousness, three

basic criteria must be met. First, there must be some suggestion or motivation, either in the references themselves or in the knowledge generally available to one of ordinary skill in the art, to modify the reference or to combine reference teachings. Second, there must be a reasonable expectation of success. Finally, the prior art reference (or references when combined) must teach or suggest all the claim limitations. The teaching or suggestion to make the claimed combination and the reasonable expectation of success must both be found in the prior art, and not based on applicants' disclosure. *In re Vaeck*, 947 F.2d 488, 20 USPQ2d 1438 (Fed. Cir. 1991)."

Claim 141 is the rejected independent claim. Applicants have amended claim 141 by replacing "flowing" with "continuously transporting" to more particularly point out Applicants' invention. According to the American Heritage College Dictionary, 3^{rd} ed., page 523 (copy of the relevant page is attached to this submission as Exhibit A) "to flow" means "[t]o move or run smoothly with unbroken continuity", "to circulate", "to move steadily", etc. "Flowing" is therefore entirely different from "easily moving a sample in and out of the vessel", as alleged in the Office Action (page 7, lines 15-16). Applicants submit that the amendment to claim 141 is for clarification only and does not require a new search. Applicants submit that the scope of this claim is not narrowed by this amendment.

Claim 146 which depends from claim 141 recites that the reaction vessel is implemented as a conduit. One such embodiment is illustrated in FIG. 7 and described in detail in Section D (Sterilizing) on page 42, line 24, to page 44, line 30. None of the references of record teach or suggest a reaction vessel implemented as a conduit.

Murry '069 teaches an ultrasonic method and apparatus for ultrasonic material processing, such as cavitation, emulsification and mixing. Murry's apparatus includes at least two ultrasonic transducers which are mounted to a wall 12 of a tank 10. Tank 10 holds the substances to be intermixed. A sample 11, such as a single liquid, can be placed in the tank, either from the top of tank 10 or (see FIG. 3) through loading plug 51 of tank 50. Murry '069 also discloses mixing and emulsification by using liquid jets, for example in chamber 62 (FIG. 4), or air whistles (FIG. 7). However, Murry '069 fails to disclose or suggest the combination of continuously transporting samples and applying sonic energy.

Berger '573 discloses a reactor for carrying out chemical reactions which includes multiple ultrasonic transducers 15 and a vessel 10 with filling ports 11 and 12 and a bottom outlet valve 8. Berger contains no disclosure or suggestion to continuously transport (or flow) samples into and out of the reaction vessel.

Applicants contend that the cited references fail to satisfy the criteria for a *prima facie* case of obviousness. Specifically, Applicants contend that the cited references fail to teach or suggest the incorporation in the reaction vessel of an inlet and an outlet for continuously transporting samples in and out of the reaction vessel. Because the combination of references fails to teach or suggest each and every limitation of the claimed invention, the cited references fail to undermine the patentability of the claimed invention. Reconsideration and withdrawal of the rejection is respectfully requested.

Claims 47 - 49, 51 - 52, 66 - 79, and 143 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as allegedly unpatentable over Berger '573 in view of Murry '069, and Ganguly et al. (US Patent No. 4,926,871; the "871" patent).

Claim 47, the independent claim from which the others depend, is directed to an apparatus for treating one or more samples comprising a reaction vessel for holding the one or more samples and including at least one inlet for flowing the one or more samples into the reaction vessel and at least one outlet for flowing the one or more samples out of the reaction vessel; and an acoustic energy source for providing at least one focused acoustic field having a frequency of between about 100 kilohertz and about 100 megahertz to the one or more samples while the one or more samples are in the reaction vessel, wherein the acoustic energy source is a single transducer.

The Office Action alleges that the Berger '573 patent teaches all of the elements of this claim, with the exception of an acoustic field having a frequency of between about 100 kHz and about 100 MHz, and the acoustic energy source being a single transducer. The Office Action then relies on Murry '069 as disclosing frequencies within the frequency range and further cites Ganguly '871 as teaching the use of a single transducer.

The teachings of Berger '573 and Murry '069 are discussed above. Ganguly '871 discloses a scanhead 10 for medical non-invasive diagnostic purposes, e.g., for measuring the volume of urine in a human bladder. The scanhead 10 may include several transducers or a single focused transducer. Ganguly does not teach or suggest providing acoustic energy to a reaction vessel for treating samples; instead, Ganguly teaches merely an imaging application having entirely different energy and focusing requirements.

As to motivation to combine, the Office Action suggests that it would have been obvious to modify the apparatus taught in Berger '573 and Murry '069 with a single focused transducer, because it was known in the art to simplify a device by minimizing the number of elements in the device, as exemplified by Ganguly '871.

However, these references are not properly combinable. There are three possible sources for a motivation to combine references: the nature of the problem to be solved, the teachings of the prior art, and the knowledge of persons of ordinary skill in the art. *In re Rouffet*, 149 F.3d 1350, 1357, 47 USPQ2d 1453, 1457-58 (Fed. Cir. 1998).

Ganguly '871 teaches a sonic device operating by emitting weak focused signals that do not heat, disrupt, or otherwise alter human tissue and detecting a return signal. However, Murry's and Berger's apparatuses operate by entirely different principles. Instead of detecting sonic waves reflected from a tissue border or interface in the human body to generate information about the geometry of the interface, as in Ganguly '871, Murry '069 and Berger '573 apply focused acoustic energy to treat, i.e., alter a physical or chemical state of, one or more samples. The result is not an image or other information, but an altered state of the sample. Since the two devices use different physical principles, i.e., imaging through reflection in Ganguly '871 versus mixing/cavitation/ emulsification in Murry '069 and Berger '573, to generate different types of effects in very different ways, one of ordinary skill in the art would not be motivated to combine these references. Indeed, there is no suggestion that the reaction processes would be improved (or even possible) by employing a single transducer, and in fact both Murry '069 and Berger '573 advocate using at least two, if not more, transducers, thus teaching away from the use of a single transducer. Moreover, contrary to the allegations of the Office Action, one of ordinary skill in the art would not be motivated to use a single transducer as there is no apparent technical

principle that would improve upon the results disclosed by Murry '069 and Berger '573. Without a motivation to combine, a rejection based on a *prima facie* case of obviousness is improper, and the level of skill in the art cannot be relied upon to provide the suggestion to combine references. (*Al-Site Corp. v. VSI Int'l Inc.*, 174 F.3d 1308, 50 USPQ2d 1161 (Fed. Cir. 1999) and *In re Kotzab*, 217 F.3d at 1371, 55 USPQ2d at 1318.) (MPEP 2143.01(I))

Indeed, substituting the transducers used by Berger '573 and Murry '069 with the transducer used by Ganguly '871 would result in an apparatus that is not suitable for the intended purpose of <u>any</u> of these references (MPEP 2143.01(V)); instead, the combination would be capable only of imaging the contents of the reaction vessel, which is unlikely to generate any useful information or result.

Thus, these references, whether taken singly or in combination, fail to teach all the elements of claim 47. To the contrary, the references teach away from the proposed combination, and in fact the combination would be unsuitable for any purpose contemplated by these references. Accordingly, the proposed combination cannot render the claim invention obvious.

In addition, claim 143, which depends from claim 47, recites that the reaction vessel is implemented as a conduit. One such embodiment is illustrated in FIG. 7 and described in detail in Section D (Sterilizing) on page 42, line 24, to page 44, line 30. None of the references of record teach or suggest a reaction vessel is implemented as a conduit. Therefore, in addition to the arguments detailed above, which apply with equal force to claim 143, the proposed combination of references fails to teach all the elements of claim 143. As a result, the proposed combination of references cannot render this claim obvious.

Claims 50 and 53-61 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as allegedly unpatentable over Berger '573 patent in view of Murry '069 and Ganguly '871, and further in view of Peltzer (U.S. Patent No. 5,993,671; the "671 patent"). Applicants traverse this rejection and contend that the rejection is moot in light of the amended claims.

Applicants' arguments detailed above are equally applicable to this ground of rejection. Peltzer '671 contains no disclosure that remedies any of the deficiencies noted above.

Accordingly, the combination of the cited references fails to render the claimed invention obvious. Reconsideration and withdrawal of this rejection is respectfully requested.

CONCLUSION

In view of the foregoing amendments and remarks, Applicants submit that the pending claims are in condition for allowance. Early and favorable reconsideration is respectfully solicited. The Examiner may address any questions raised by this submission to the undersigned at 617-951-7000. Should an extension of time be required, Applicants hereby petition for same and request that the extension fee and any other fee required for timely consideration of this submission be charged to **Deposit Account No. 18-1945 under Order No. CVRS-P04-001.**

Date: November 15, 2006

Respectfully Submitted,

Wolfgang E/Stutius Reg. No. 40,256

Fish & Neave IP Group, Ropes & Gray LLP

One International Place Boston, MA 02110 Phone: 617-951-7000

Fax: 617-951-7050

THE AMERICAN HERITAGE® COLLEGE DICTIONARY

THIRD EDITION



HOUGHTON MIFFLIN COMPANY

Boston • New York

e, used in making floors.

A tall lamp with a base that stands on the

n. Merchandise sold at a reduced price be admit Ocean.

display or demonstration model.

ruters and minicomputers to store data.

3, flôr's) n., pl. florras or florrae (flôrl's tits) of the number, distribution, and relationships of plant into considered as a group, esp. the plant of the number, distribution, and relationships of plant process in one or more areas.

1. The bacteria and other tregion or time. 3. The bacteria and other than normally inhabit a body organ or process. The provide (flôr/yoō-it. -oō- flôr/- flôr/s) and the process of the number, distribution, and relationships of plant process in one or more areas.

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers:

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers.

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers.

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of flowers.

2. A treatise described flores suff. Having a specified kind or number of

12, flor 2) n. Rom. Myth. The goddess of the 12 flos, flor, flower. See bhel. 2 1 tol, flor 2) adj. Of, relating to, or suggest fabric with a floral pattern. — floral yet n. A tubular or cup-shaped structure of st

a its rim the sepals, petals, and stamens. lope n. The perianth of a flower. n. A tube usu. formed by the basal fusion ind stamens, as in the flowers of the diffed flor / ans, flor / -). 1. Also Floren ze (female entral Italy on the Arno R. E of Piss; 15 during the Renaissance. Pop. 453,293.21 WNW of Decatur; founded 1818. Pop. 360 E SC ENE of Columbia. Pop. 29,813.

E SC ENE of Columbia. 109. 29,000. annel n. See finocchio. ne (flor'on-ten', -tin', flor'-) adj. 1. Ora ice, Italy. 2. Of or relating to the styk df. ire that flourished in Florence, Italy, duright 3. Often florentine. Having or characteristic trubbed finish. Used of gold. 4. Prepared relative or inhabitan displayed of the property ith spinach. — n. A native or inhabitant of the life returns of th lôr 'is, -ēz, flor '-). An island of E Indon on the Flores Sea, between the E and the W end of the Banda Sea S of the new (flôres' sns, flor) n. A condition, tone, ing. [NLat. flôrescenta < Lat. flôrescent, inchoative of flôrescene, inchoative of florescene, inchoative of flore

of flor, flower. See

flôr'ē, flôr'ē), Sir Howard Walter. It no po lis (flor e-a nop alis, flor, flor city of SE Brazil on an island just off the city of SE Brazil on an island just off the mainland by a suspension bridge, pop. Life ed also flore at ed (flore a vid. flore) with floral designs. [< Lat. flos, flore)

.]
In·da (flôr'ə-bun'də, flōr'-) n. Any of aring numerous single or double flores nundus, blossoming freely < Lat. flos.

ine (flôr/'i-kān', flôr'-) n. The flowers a biennial plant, esp. of a bramble lessee FLOWER + CANE.]

1 **ture (flôr'/-kül'char, flôr'-) n. The flore flôr'-lessee flore flore

+ CULTURE.] - flo'rl·cul'tur-sur · ty adv. - flo'rl·cul'tur-str flor'id, flor'-) adj. 1. Flushed with rea y ornate; flowery. 3. Archaid. Heinty ding in or covered with flowers. [Fe-

:/ ing, flor/-) n. 1. A floor. 2. Material, pidus < floor, flor/ flower. See bhel-3*.) — flor/id/i-ty, flor/ id-ness n. — flor/id-ly adv. e, used in making floors.

A tall lamp with a base that stands on the floor id/i-da, flor/i-da, flor/ of the SE U.S. bordering

to the number of a legislature chosen by the Atlantic Ocean and the Gulf of Mexico; admitted as t. The member of a legislature chosen by the Atlantic Ocean and the Gullt of Mexico; admitted as sets to direct the party's activities on the state in 1845. The region was ceded to the U.S. by the state in 1849. Cap. Tallahassee. Pop. 13,003,362. — Flor n. 1. See floorwalker. 2. A person who or, as at a political convention.

A scale diagram of a room or building the state of the

Merchandise sold at a reduced price be a display or demonstration model. Isplay or demonst

noisily. — n. 1. The act of flopping. 2. Its plane in the florentine flopping. 3. Informal. An utter failure. [Air flopping. 3. Informal. An utter failure. [Air

n. Comp. Sci. A flexible plastic disk compared a sciling flowers and ornamental plants. [Lat. flos, flor-, taterial and covered by a protective jacka puters and minicomputers to store data.]

"In the district of the state of t

burish. See FLOURISH.]

burish. See FLOURISH.]

bry (llôr/e, flôr/e), Paul John. 1910–1985. Amer. chemist bo won a 1974 Nobel Prize.

(flos, flos) n. 1. Dental floss. 2. Short or waste silk fibers, so from a silkworm cocoon. 3. Soft, loosely twisted thread, and silk, used in embroidery. 4. A downy or silky fibrous absence, such as corn silk. $-\nu$. flossed, floss ing, floss. **8.** -tr. To clean between (teeth) with dental floss. — intr. box dental floss. [Perh. alteration of Fr. floche, tuft of wool

(Ofr. floc, floche < Lat. floccus.) — floss'er n.

10 floss'e, flos'e, adj. -1-er. -1-est. 1. Superficially stylish;

11 flossy articles. 2. Of, relating to, or resembling floss. floss'i ly adv. - floss'i ness n

rage also float age (flo 'tij) n. 1. See flotation 1. 2. Floates objects or material; flotsam.

to objects or material; flotsam.

1. The act, procue or condition of floating. 2. The act or an instance of taxhing or initiating, esp. one involving the floating of taxhing or initiating, esp. one involving the floating of taxhing or initiating, esp. one involving the floating of taxhing or initiating, esp. one involving the floating of taxhing or initiating a pulverized mixture of the this, sp. minerals, by agitating a pulverized mixture of the strike with water, oil, or chemicals. 4. The capability, esp. da thick tread or tire, to remain on top of a soft surface.

the transfer of the preserver.

1. A life preserver.

1. A life preserver.

1. A small fleet. b. A fleet of small fleet. b. A fleet of small fleet. b. A fleet of small fleet. A U.S. Navy organizational unit of two or more actions of small warships. 3. Informal. A group of vehicles

that of the same warships. S. Informat. It group of ventures are operated as a unit. (Sp., dim. of flota, fleet < OFr. of flota, fleet < OFr. of flota, same flota, flota,

tim (fide sim). n. 1.a. Wreckage or cargo alloat and similar to the similar fed similar to the s

mang: [Poss. of Scand. orig.]

Material used to make flounces.

Schenicof flounces, as on a curtain. dered: dereing, ders. 1. To or regain one's balance. 2. To infusion. See Syns at blunder.

See Usage Note at founder¹. -n. The act of floundering. [Prob. alteration of FOUNDER 1.] floun•der 2 (floun•der) n., pl. flounder or -ders. Any of various

marine flatfishes of the families Bothidae and Pleuronectidae, which include important food fishes. [ME < AN floundre, of Scand, orig. See plat-*.]

flour (flour) n. 1. A fine powdery foodstuff obtained by grinding and sifting the meal of a grain, esp. wheat, used chiefly in baking. 2. Any of various similar finely ground or powdered foodstuffs, as of cassava, fish, or bananas. 3. A soft fine powder. $-tr.\nu$. floured, floureing, flours. 1. To cover or coat with flour. 2. To make into flour. [ME. See FLOWER.] – flour'y adi.

flour · ish (flur ' ish, flur ' -) v. -ished, -ish · ing, -ish · es. — intr. 1. To grow well or luxuriantly; thrive. 2. To do or fare well; prosper. 3. To be in a period of highest productivity, excellence, or influence. 4. To make bold, sweeping movements. - tr. To wield, wave, or exhibit dramatically. - n. 1. A dramatic or stylish movement, as of waving or brandishing. matic or stylish movement, as of waving or brandishing.

2. An embellishment or ornamentation: many rhetorical flourishes. 3. An ostentatious act or gesture. 4. Mus. A showy or ceremonious passage, such as a fanfare. [ME florishen < OFr. florir, floriss < VLat. *florire < Lat. floree < flos, flor, flower. See bhel-3*.] - flour'lsheer.

Syns: flourish, brandish, wave. The central meaning shared by these verbs is "to swing back and forth boldly and dramatically": flourished her newly signed contract; brandishing a sword: waving a baton.

dishing a sword; waving a baton.

flout (flout) v. flout ed, flout lng, flouts. - tr. To show contempt for; scorn: flouted convention. See Usage Note at flaunt. — intr. To be scornful. — n. A contemptuous action or remark; an insult. [Perh. < ME flouten, to play the flute < OFr. flauter < flaute, flute: See FLUTE.] — flout'er n. - flout/ing•iv adν.

flow (flo) v. flowed, flow-ing, flows. - intr. 1.a. To move or run smoothly with unbroken continuity, as a fluid. b. To issue in a stream; pour forth. 2. To circulate, as the blood in the body. 3. To move with a continual shifting of the component particles: Wheat flowed into the bin. 4. To proceed steadily and easily. 5. To exhibit a smooth or graceful continuity. 6. To hang loosely and gracefully. 7. To rise. Used of the tide. 8. To arise; derive. See Syns at stem¹. 9.a. To abound or teem. b. To stream copiously; flood: Contributions flowed in.

10. To menstruate. 11. To undergo plastic deformation without cracking or breaking. Used of rocks, metals, or minerals. -tr. 1. To release as a flow. 2. To cause to flow. -n. 1.a. The act of flowing. b. The smooth motion characteristic of fluids. 2.a. A stream or current, b. A flood or an overflow. c. A residual mass that has stopped flowing: a hardened lava flow. 3.a. A continuous output or outpouring. b. A continuous movement or circulation: a flow of paperwork. 4. The amount that flows in a given period of time. 5. The rising of the tide. 6. Continuity and smoothness of appearance. 7. A general movement or tendency. 8. The sequence in which operations are performed. 9. An apparent ease or effortlessness of performance. 10. Menstrual discharge. [ME flouen < OE flowan. See pleu-*]. — flow/ing* have yet.

flowan. See pleu.*.] — flow/ing·ly adv.

flowage (flo/ij) n. 1. The act of flowing or overflowing.

Z.a. The state of being flooded. b. A body of water formed by usu. deliberate flooding. 3. An outflow or overflow. 4. The gradual plastic deformation of a solid body, as by heat. flow chart also flow-chart (flo'chart') n. A schematic repre-

sentation of a sequence of operations. flow er (flou'ar) n. 1.a. The reproductive structure of some seed-bearing plants, characteristically having either special-ized male or female organs or both male and female organs enclosed in an outer envelope of petals and sepals. b. Such a structure having showy or colorful parts; a blossom. 2. A plant that is cultivated or appreciated for its blossoms. 3. The condition or a time of having developed flowers. 4. Some thing, such as an ornament, that resembles a flower in shape, fineness, or attractiveness. S. The period of highest development; the peak. 6. The highest example or best representative. 7. A natural development or outgrowth. 8. flowers. Chem. A 7. A natural development or outgrown. 8. Howers. Chem. A fine powder produced by condensation or sublimation of a compound. — v. -ered, -er-lng, -ers. — intr. 1. To produce a flower or flowers; blossom. 2. To develop naturally or fully; mature. — tr. To decorate with flowers or a floral pattern. [ME flour, flower, best of anything, flour < OFr. flor < Lat. flox, flor. See bhel. 3.] — flow/er-er. — flow/er-less adj. flow er age (flou ar ij n. 1. Flowers considered as a group.

2. The process or state of flowering.

flower bug n. Any of a group of bugs in the family Antho-coridae, which feed on insects that infest flowers.

flower child n. Informal. A hippie, esp. one advocating universal peace and love. — flow'er-child' (flou' or-child') adj. flow er et (flou ' er-it) n. A small flower; a floret.

flower glrl n. A young girl who carries flowers in a procession. flower head n. 1. Bot. A dense short compact cluster of sessile flowers, as of composite plants or clover. 2. A grouping of flower buds, as in broccoli and cauliflow flow er ing dogwood (flou ring) n. See dogwood. of flower buds, as in broccoli and cauliflower.

Florida flowering dogwood



flotilla On the Indian Ocean

ă pat oi boy ă pay ou out âr care on took ä father oo boot ě pet ē be ŭ cut ûr urge th thin pit pie th this hw which îr pie zh vision ŏ pot ō toe a about.

Stress marks: (primary); (secondary), as in dictionary (dǐk shə-něr ě)

BEST AVAILABLE COPY